



The Politics of Human Development in Pakistan

Political Science 219
Wellesley College
Spring 2014

Instructors

at Fatima Jinnah Women University

Fayyaz Baqir, Director, Akhter Hameed Khan Resource Centre,
Islamabad, Pakistan

Office hours: by appointment
Office: House 25, Street 21 F-7/2 Islamabad
Office phone: 92-51-265-2229 or cell phone: 92-300-501-7139
Skype name: fayyaz.baqir

Adeela Rehman, Lecturer, Department of Gender Studies,
Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Office hours: by appointment
Office: Department of Gender Studies,
Fatima Jinnah Women University, The Mall, Rawalpindi
Cell phone: 92- 333 5381859
Skype name: dradeelarehman

at Wellesley College

Christopher Candland, Associate Professor of Political Science,
Wellesley College, Wellesley MA, USA

Office hours: Wed and Thu 14.00 – 16.00 (EST/EDT) or by appointment
Office: 249 Pendleton East
Office phone: 1-781-283-2197
Skype name: christophercandland

Course Venues

At Fatima Jinnah Women University:
Video Conference Room

At Wellesley College:

Pendleton East 129

Course Timing

At Fatima Jinnah Women University:

before March 12 6:30 pm– 9:30 pm (PST)
on and after March 12 5:30 – 8:30 pm (PST)

At Wellesley College:

before March 12 Wednesdays 8:30–11:30 (EST)
after March 12 Wednesdays 8:30–11:30 (EDT)

Course Description

Pakistan has faced formidable challenges in human development. At the same time, some community development associations in Pakistan have been greatly successful, by many measures, and models for people in other countries. This course analyzes policies and practices related to human development in Pakistan.

All classes are held by videoconference involving students at Wellesley College (in Wellesley Massachusetts USA) and at Fatima Jinnah Women University (in Rawalpindi Pakistan). Students will discuss the reading with the instructors, interact with one another, and interact with Pakistani leaders in human development.

Issues considered include formative national economic development models, the turn toward human development measures, the centrality of gender to human development, women's health, basic education, community development in rural and urban settings, rights of minorities, women, and workers, and legal and political conditions for high human development achievements. Among the programs we examine are the Aga Khan Rural Support Programme in Gilgit-Baltistan, the nation-wide Citizens Foundation schools, and the Orangi Pilot Project.

Format

Roughly half of each class will be devoted to presentation of concepts and discussion of the assigned reading. About two-thirds of each of seven classes will be devoted to presentations and interactions with world leaders in their fields. Guests will speak for 45-60 minutes and answer students' questions for an hour or so. To help allow students to develop their own judgment about the challenges and lessons from diverse Pakistani experiences with human development, each speakers will be asked to address a common set of questions.

If all agree, the guest lectures and following question and answer periods will be recorded and posted to the Akhter Hameed Khan Resource Centre web page. You have a right to ensure that your image and voice not be recorded or taped. The instructors will help you to protect that right. Only those who sign a release from will be recorded or taped.

The electronic course conference is private; it is open only to registered students and the instructors.

Assignments

Please do the assigned reading and post to the electronic conference either an answer to the study questions for the class or some other response to the reading (such as a question of your own, a perspective that you gained, or a disagreement that you have with the reading). Please post your responses by 22.00 PST / 13.00 EST/EDT on the Monday before class. Study questions are written to help guide your reading. These responses may be as brief as 50 words and will not be graded.

In addition to the ungraded assignments – class attendance, weekly reading, posting of answers to study questions or responses to reading and a couple of out-of-class assignments (to allow students from the two classrooms to connect out of class) –there are two written assignments that are graded. These are a short paper (no more than 1,500 words) due before 23.00 PST / 13.00 EDT on Thursday March 13 and a longer paper (no more than 3,500 words) due before 23.00 PST / 13.00 EDT on Tuesday May 20. The short paper is worth 25% of the final grade; the final paper is worth 50% of the final grade. Informed class participation is worth 25% of the final grade.

Additional Information

This course belongs to you, its student. The instructors are here to facilitate your learning. Please let us know how the course can be adapted to meet your learning needs.

Early Assignments

1. Please post to the Sakai course conference as an introduction to other class members, at least two biographical details and one learning goal for the course. Please do this by 23.00 PST (13.00 EST) on Monday, February 3.
2. Please post to the Sakai course conference your assessment of what the greatest challenge (or set of challenges) to human development is. Please do this by 23.00 PST (13.00 EST) on Monday, February 22. These will be discussed in class on Wednesday, February 26.

Other assignments are in the class schedule below.

Class Schedule

Wednesday, January 29 _____

[Note: This is before FJWU students begin their semester.]

1. Overview of Pakistan's Demographics, Economics, and Politics

Candland in Krieger "Pakistan" (Candland in Krieger 2013: 3 pp)

Candland in Long "Poverty and Inequality: Persistent Effects of Pakistan's Formative Economic Development Model" (Candland in Long 2014: 26 pp)

Wednesday, February 5 _____

[Note: This is Fatima Jinnah Women University students' first class.]

2. Introductions and Discussion of Nation, State, Politics, and People

Tagore, "Nationalism in the West" (Tagore: 1918: 3-46)

Study Question:

What does Tagore mean when he writes that India (by which he means all of South Asia) had centuries of invaders but only with the British did it encounter a nation?

What is the difference between the state, the government, and the nation? Why do many scholars and politicians use these terms as if they were synonymous?

Wednesday, February 12 _____

3. Economic and Human Development in Pakistan: The Neo-Classical Legacy

Haq, "An Approach to Economic Planning" (Haq 1963: 1-31)

Papanek, "Gentleman at Work" (Papanek 1967: 75-105)

Study Questions: What is the "two-sector growth model with unlimited supplies of labor"? Why were growth models adopted by Pakistan in the 1950s and 1960s?

Wednesday, February 19 _____

4. The Transition to Human Centered Development

Guest Lecturer: Ms. Khadija Haq

Founding Director, Mahbubul Haq Human Development Centre

Streeten, "Forward" (Streeten in Haq 1995: ix-xviii)

Khan, "Orangi: The Art of Survival" (Khan 8-12)

Sen, "A Decade of Human Development" (Sen 2000: 17-23)

Haq et al, "Economic Growth and Human Development in Pakistan"

(Haq et al 2008: 68-90)

Ake, "Development and Underdevelopment" (in Krieger 2000: 218-221)

Sen, "Poverty as Capacity Deprivation" (Sen 1999: 87-110)

Study Questions: What is human development? How does it differ from economic development? What is the relationship between economic development and human development?

Wednesday, February 26 _____

5. Student Reports on Human Development Challenges

What are the greatest development challenges in the world?

5 minutes for each student

Assignment: read all other students' responses

Wednesday, March 5 _____

6. Gender and Human Development

Guest Lecturer: Ms. Nafisa Shah, Chairperson
National Commission for Human Development

Haq et al, "Women in South Asia" (Haq et al 2008: 201-219)
World Bank "The Political Economy of Gender Reform" (World Bank 2012 330-345)

Study Question: Pakistani women have held the office of Prime Minister, Speaker of the National Assembly, Foreign Minister, Information Minister, Defence Secretary, and Ambassador. At the same time, the ratio of females to males in the population and the ratio of formally educated literate females to and formally educated literate males suggest that there is pervasive gender discrimination in Pakistan. How do you explain the contrast between the apparent female empowerment at higher levels of political leadership and the apparent widespread discrimination against girls and women in Pakistan?

Wednesday March 12 _____

7. Basic Education and Social Opportunity

Guest Lecturer: Ahsan Saleem
Founding Director, The Citizens' Foundation

Haq et al, "A Ten Year Review of Education in Pakistan" (Haq et al 2008: 144-159)
Campaign for Quality Education, "Pakistan Education: What Works and Why?"
(Campaign for Quality Education 2009: 1-48)

Study Question:
What is required to ensure that all school-aged children in Pakistan are in school?

Wednesday, March 19 _____

8. Gender and Health

Guest Lecturer: Dr. Abdul Ghaffar Biilloo
Founding Director, Health and Nutrition Society

Tinker, "Improving Women's Health in Pakistan" (Tinker 1998: 1-40)
Shaikh, Haran, and Hatcher, "Women's Social Position and Health-Seeking Behaviors"
(Shaikh, Haran, and Hatcher 2008: 945-959)

Study Questions: What major health challenges do women in Pakistan face? Why are we not nearer the objectives for women's health mentioned by Ann Tinker nearly 15 years ago?

Wednesday, March 26 _____
Spring Break – No Classes at Wellesley

(Candland will attend the class in person in Pakistan. Wellesley students may join.)

Wednesday, April 2 _____

9. Orangi Pilot Project

Guest Lecturer: Arif Hasan, Architect
Orangi Pilot Project

Khan, *Orangi Pilot Project*, chapter
Khan, "Comments By Director OPP on UNCHS CTA's Appraisal," (Khan 169-171)
Hasan, *Participatory Development*, chapters 5 through 8

Study Questions: The Orangi Pilot Project experience highlights the inherent weakness of a "results oriented blue print" approach compared to the unpredictable "process oriented organic approach" for human development. What do you see to be the fundamental differences in the dynamics of both these approaches? Which model is more conducive to human development in lower income communities?

Wednesday April 9 _____

10. The Rural Support Programme Experience

Guest Lecturer: Shandana Khan, Chief Executive Officer
Rural Support Programme Network

Khan, *The Aga Khan Rural Support Programme*, chapter or two
Gloekler and Seeley, "Gender and AKRSP – Mainstreamed or Sidelined?"
(Wood 2006)

Study Questions: What are the challenges for establishing community solidarity in areas where the AKRSP works? What are the AKRSP strategies for fostering trust between the community and the organizers? Are these strategies that can be as easily adopted by government agencies as by non-governmental agencies?

Wednesday April 16 _____

11. Formal and Informal Labor

Guest Lecturer: Farhat Parveen, Chief Executive
National Organization for Working Communities

Shahid, "Challenging Silences: Listening to Untold Stories of Women Domestic Workers in Pakistan" (Shahid 2010: 147-188)
Friedmann-Sánchez and Griffin "Defining the Boundaries between Unpaid Labor and Unpaid Caregiving" (Friedmann-Sánchez and Griffin 2011: 511-534)

Study Questions: What are the major hindrances to fundamental rights at work of women domestic workers? What can be done to remove these hindrances? What is being done?

Wednesday April 23 _____

12. Political Conditions for Human Development

Guest Lecturer: I. A. Rehman, Chairperson
Human Rights Commission of Pakistan

UN Women, *Progress of the World's Women 2011-2012* (2012) available [here](#)

Study Questions:

Under what conditions does the law perpetuate class and gender inequalities and under what conditions can the law transform class and gender inequalities? Reviewing the UN Women report consider and propose a specific legal intervention that would be most beneficial for Pakistani women.

Wednesday April 30 _____
Ruhlman Conference – No Classes at Wellesley

Wednesday May 7 _____
13. Justice for Women Workers

Guest Lecturer: Nasira Javed Iqbal, Justice (retired)

Haq, et al, "Sources of Hope for South Asia" (Mahbub ul Haq Human Development Centre 2008: 237-246)

Shahid, "Toward an Integrated Approach: Non-Legal and Legal Strategies for the Protection of Women Domestic Workers in Pakistan" (Shahid 2010: 189-208)

Study Question:

What can the law do and what can is the law unable to do in promoting human rights in Pakistan?

Reading: Orwell "Politics and the English Language"

Assignment: Post to the course conference the question to which your final paper will be an answer.

Bibliography

- Ake, Claude, "Development and Underdevelopment" in Joel Krieger, ed., *Oxford Companion to World Politics*, (Oxford, 2000) 218-223
- Burki, Shahid Javed, *Historical Dictionary of Pakistan*, (Vision Books, 2003)
- Candland, Christopher, "Civil Society," in Joel Krieger, ed., *Oxford Companion to Comparative Politics*, (Oxford, 2012)
- Candland, Christopher, "Pakistan," in Joel Krieger, ed., *Oxford Companion to Comparative Politics*, (Oxford, 2012)
- Candland, Christopher, "The Roots of Inequality: Pakistan's Formative Economic Development Strategy and its Legacy," in Roger Long, ed., *The History of Pakistan*, (Oxford 2012)
- Candland, Christopher, "Social Capital," in Joel Krieger, ed., *Oxford Companion to Comparative Politics*, (Oxford, 2012)
- Edhi, Abdus Sattar, *An Autobiography: A Mirror to the Blind*, Tehmina Durrani, ed., (National Bureau of Publications, 1996)
- Fernando, Jude, "Nongovernmental Organizations, Micro-Credit, and Empowerment of Women," in Jude Fernando and Alan Heston, eds., *The Role of NGOs: Charity and Empowerment*, The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, (volume 554), Sage Periodical Press, November 1997
- Friedmann-Sánchez, Greta, and Joan Griffin, "Defining the Boundaries between Unpaid Labor and Unpaid Caregiving: Review of the Social and Health Sciences Literature," *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 12: 4, (November 2011), 511-534
- Friends of Akhuwat, *Akhuwat: Microfinance with a Difference*, (Friends of Akhuwat 2008)
- Fukuda-Parr, "Theory and Policy in International Development: Human Development and Capability Approach and the Millennium Development Goals" (Fukuda-Parr 2011) 122-132
- Haq, Mahbub ul, *Reflections on Human Development*, (Karachi: Oxford, 1995)
- Haq, Mahbub ul, *The Strategy of Economic Planning: A Case Study of Pakistan*, (Oxford, 1963)
- Khan, Aga (His Highness) *Where Hope Takes Root: Democracy and Pluralism in an Interdependent World* (Douglas and McIntyre, 2008)
- Khan, Akhter Hameed, *Orangi Pilot Project: Reminiscences and Reflections*, (Oxford, 2005)
- Khan, Rina Saeed, ed., *Islands of Hope: Recollections of Dr. Akhter Hameed Khan*, (Lahore: Vanguard Book, 2010)
- Khan, Shoaib Sultan, *The Aga Khan Rural Support Programme: A Journey through Grassroots Development*, (Oxford, 2009)
- Haq, Khadija, et al, *Human Development in South Asia 2007: A Ten Year Review*, (Islamabad: Mahbub ul Haq Human development Centre, 2008)
- Hasan, Arif, *Participatory Development: The Story of the Orangi Pilot Project-Research and Training Institute and the Urban Resource Centre, Karachi, Pakistan* (Oxford, 2010)
- Hasan, Arif, *The Unplanned Revolution: Observations on the Process of Socio-Economic Changes in Pakistan*, (Oxford, 2009)
- Krieger, Joel, ed., *Oxford Companion to Comparative Politics*, (Oxford, 2012)

- Lipton, Michael, *Why Poor People Stay Poor. A Study of Urban Bias in World Development*, (Harvard, 1977)
- Maathai, Wangari Muta, *Unbowed: A Memoir*, (Alfred A. Knopf, 2006)
- Nussbaum, Martha, *Women and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach*, (Cambridge, 2000)
- Sen, Amartya, "A Decade of Human Development," *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 2000, (1: 1), 17-23
- Sen, Amartya, *Development as Freedom*, (New York: Anchor, 1999)
- Shahid, Ayesha, *Silent Voices, Untold Stories: Women Domestic Workers in Pakistan and their Struggle for Empowerment*, (Oxford, 2010)
- Stiglitz, Joseph, "Macroeconomic Fluctuations, Inequality, and Human Development," *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 13: 1, (February 2012), 31-58
- Streeten, Paul, "Forward," in Mahbub ul Haq, *Reflections on Human Development*, (Karachi: Oxford, 1995), ix-xviii
- van den Berk-Clark, Carissa, and Loretta Pyles "Deconstructing Neoliberal Community Development Approaches and a Case for the Solidarity Economy," *Journal of Progressive Human Services*, 23: 1, (2012) 1-17.
- Walker, Melanie, "A Human Development and Capabilities 'Prospective Analysis' of Global Higher Education Policies," *Journal of Education Policy*, 25: 4, (July 2010), 485-501
- Wood, Geof, Abdul Malik, and Sumaira Sagheer, eds., *Valleys in Transition: Twenty Years of AKRSP's Experience in Northern Pakistan*, (Oxford, 2006)
- World Bank, *World Development Report 2012: Gender Equality and Development*, (World Bank 2011)

Please use the following five-point approach with your papers.

1. Articulate a question.

The most crucial and often most difficult task in designing a good paper is casting a good net – asking a question that will be productive. It is not sufficient to pose a question the answer to which is information alone. Avoid questions that can be answered with raw facts or political histories. A potentially fruitful question is usually articulated as a puzzle. (e.g., How can one reconcile the empowerment of notable women in Pakistani politics and the oppression that many women face in Pakistani society?)

2. Explain briefly why that question is important to the study of the politics of human development in Pakistan.

In the face of the literature, or in the face of common sense, briefly explain why the puzzle demands an answer.

3. Defend briefly a strategy for addressing that question.

Different questions demand different approaches. A case study can answer some questions. Other questions might be better answered with comparative analysis. Some require interpretive approaches. Some require statistical analysis. Explain briefly what your approach can deliver.

4. Apply that strategy.

Most of your paper should be devoted to using your chosen strategy to answer or to reframe in a more productive way your original question. Having done the difficult work of articulating a question and devising a strategy for addressing it, this should unfold comfortably.

5. State your conclusions.

In your conclusion, state forcefully what you established. Avoid the temptations to speculate on the future, to introduce new variables, or to soft peddle your finds (e.g., “only the future will tell...”). If your conclusion makes policy recommendations, then your question must be about policy. Remember that the most revealing answer to an important question is often an explanation of why the original formulation of the question was inadequate. (e.g., Many questions depend on false dichotomies. e.g., Is the market of the government better at promoting economic growth.)

Advice and Stylistic Considerations for Final Papers

Focus. Your argument is likely to be more compelling, defensible, interesting, strong, and otherwise valuable, the narrower it is.

Being succinct is both a virtue and a requirement. Your paper must be no longer than 3,500 words. Write lengthier rough drafts. Then eliminate the non-essential. At the end of the paper, give a word count in parentheses (e.g., 3,202 words).

In your introduction, tell your reader your question, your position, and your trajectory. Your reader should not be made to feel that she does not know where you are taking her.

Encapsulate in the first sentence of each paragraph its main contribution.

Check your grammar; edit thoroughly; proof read carefully.

Avoid lists. Write prose. Avoid known metaphors. Do not use contractions.

Avoid first person claims. A sentence such as “I believe that international security forces in Afghanistan cannot gain the support of the people of Afghanistan” causes the reader to divide her attention between the authority of the writer and the claim being advanced. (e.g., Your reader may think “That’s an interesting claim. But I wonder why she believes that.”) Stating a claim directly usually gives it more credibility.

Distinguish between countries, states, political regimes, and governments and between nations, communities, and classes. A country is not an actor. Thus, a claim such as “India has preferred social equality to economic growth” leaves the reader wondering if this refers to the administrative apparatus (the state), the particular system of recruitment into that apparatus (e.g., elections, i.e., the political regime), or a particular government (e.g., the Indian National Congress). Distinguish between nations and states. A nation is a community that believes that it shares some mixture of cultural, ethnic, historical, linguistic, religious, or other identities. A state is an inanimate apparatus.

Double-space. Do not use one and one half-space formats.

Give complete phrases (e.g., non-governmental organizations) before using acronyms (e.g., NGOs). Do not capitalize common nouns.

Paginate.

Citation and Bibliography Formats

To represent another's ideas as if these ideas were your own, even if paraphrasing is a form a theft known as plagiarism. The internet has made plagiarism increasingly common. Any plagiarism will result in a failing grade and additional disciplinary measures.

Carefully citing your sources protects you and impresses your reader with the research and authority that you bring to your subject. Please use one of the following citation formats in your papers. At the conclusion of a sentence, which reflects or reports someone else's opinion or information, use either an in-text citation or a footnote.

(1.) in-text citation

An in-text citation gives the author's last name, year of publication, and page, in parentheses. (Author year: page). Then, in an attached bibliography, each source is given like this:

Last Name, First name, year, *Title of Book*, Place of Publication: Publisher.

Last Name, First name, month year, "article title," *Title of Periodical*, (Volume: Number).

Last Name, First name, year, "chapter title," in *Title of Edited Book*, First and Last Name of Editor, ed., Place of Publication: Publisher.

For example:

Kerala's performance in economic and human development owes much to its religious diversity and its tradition of matrilineal property inheritance. (Drèze and Sen 1995: 200)

Then, in your bibliography, give the full citation, like this:

Drèze, Jean, and Amartya Sen, 1995, *India: Economic Opportunity and Social Opportunity*, Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Following the in-text citation format, articles in periodicals or chapters in books should be listed in your bibliography like so:

McQueen, Cheryl, January 1992, "Pakistan: A Bold Agenda for Economic Reform," *Business America*, (113: 1).

Kemal, A. R., 1991, "Privatisation: The Experience of Pakistan," in V. Kanesalingam, ed., *Privatisation: Trends and Experiences in South Asia*, New Delhi: MacMillan India.

(2) footnote

A footnote refers your reader to a complete citation at the bottom of the page. The footnote format is:

First name Last Name, *Title of Book*, Place of Publication: Publisher, Year, Page(s).

First name Last Name, "article title," *Title of Journal*, (Volume: Number), Month Year, Page(s).

First name Last Name, "chapter title," in *Title of Edited Book*, First name Last Name of Editor, ed., Place of Publication: Publisher, Year, Page(s).

For example:

Pakistan's early development strategy intentionally promoted economic inequality as a technique for rapid economic growth.¹

¹ Angus Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth in India and Pakistan*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1973, 136.

Articles in periodicals or chapters in books should be listed in your footnote like so:

² Cheryl McQueen, "Pakistan: A Bold Agenda for Economic Reform," *Business America*, (113: 1), 13 January 1992, 8.

³ A. R. Kemal, "Privatisation: The Experience of Pakistan," in V. Kanesalingam, ed., *Privatisation: Trends and Experiences in South Asia*, New Delhi: MacMillan India, 1991, 132.

If you use footnotes, you do not need to attach a bibliography, unless there are sources that you consulted but did not cite and you want the reader to be aware of these.

If you use the footnote format, please do use footnotes (i.e., citations at the bottom of the page) not endnotes (i.e., citations at the end of the paper). It cuts down on page turning and allows the reader to focus on your argument. The instructors prefer the footnote format, but you are free to use the in-text format.